Case 1:11-bk-12133 Doc 43 Filed 12/22/11 Entered 12/22/11 09:50:13 Desc Main Document Page 1 of 4

UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF RHODE ISLAND

- - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - x

In re:

FRANCISCO MAIOLINO : BK No. 11-12133

Debtor Chapter 13

- - - - - - - - - - - - - - - - x

DECISION AND ORDER MODIFYING SECURED CLAIM

APPEARANCES:

Jeffrey Dana Attorney for Debtor THE FAMILY LAW CENTER OF RI 38 Bellevue Avenue, Suite G Newport, Rhode Island 02840

Kathryn A. Fyans HARMON LAW OFFICES, P.C. P.O. Box 610345 Newton Highlands, Massachusetts 02461-0345

BEFORE ARTHUR N. VOTOLATO, United States Bankruptcy Judge

BK No. 11-12133

Heard on Debtor Francisco Maiolino's ("Maiolino") Motion to Modify (i.e., reduce) the Secured Claim of Creditor JP Morgan Chase Bank, N.A. ("Chase") to the fair market value of Maiolino's house on which Chase holds a mortgage. Maiolino contends that the value of his house at 57-59 Corinth Street, Providence, Rhode Island, is \$80,000. Chase places the value of the property at \$97,000.

The parties submitted a Joint Pre-Trial Order with exhibits including an opinion of value of \$80,000 by Peter H. Hurley ("Hurley") for the Debtor, and an appraisal of \$97,000 by Melissa M. Perrille ("Perrille") for Chase. It is stipulated that both witnesses are qualified as experts in real estate valuation, and the parties have submitted the matter for a decision based on the record, and without an evidentiary hearing.

Peter Hurley used the comparable (or comparative) sales approach in arriving at his opinion of value of the subject property, and Melissa Perrille used both the comparable sales approach and the income approach. Hurley and Perrille utilized different properties in this case, except for one point of agreement. Perrille used 232 Baker Street as a comparable rental property in applying her income approach, while Hurley used the same property as one of his comparable sales. Although their other examples differ, the appraisers agree that 232 Baker Street is

Case 1:11-bk-12133 Doc 43 Filed 12/22/11 Entered 12/22/11 09:50:13 Desc Main Document Page 3 of 4

BK No. 11-12133

similar to the Debtor's house. The Baker Street property sold for \$80,000, on December 6, 2010.

Upon careful consideration, all of the evidence supporting a value higher than \$80,000 for the subject property was unpersuasive, and based on the appraisals and our independent analysis of the evidence, this Court adopts \$80,000 as the correct estimate of the value of 57-59 Corinth Street. Ms. Perrille's supporting documentation and opinion of value are rejected. Therefore, Maiolino's Motion to Modify Chase's Secured Claim is GRANTED, and Judgment shall enter consistent with the terms of this Decision.

Entered:

Arthur N. Votolato U.S. Bankruptcy Court

Perthuli Vote

Entered on docket: 12/22/11

¹ Particularly off the mark is Perrille's characterization of Corinth Street as "suburban." In fact, it is a densely populated, classic inner-city neighborhood of predominantly multi-family houses, located one block from eight lanes of Interstate 95. See Creditor's Ex. B - Part 3, Pg. 12, attached as Exhibit A.

C@3354:1.11-blok-212333 D@06437-#ile#ile&22121/1017/1 Enterrete 1621/2121/1017/09t 50841814:0BesD44ain Exhibit Blookeatt AA: Page 4:1014 4f 14 BK 11-12133 Exhibit A

| | BK II | -12133 | EXHIDIT A |
|------|---------|--------|-----------|
| | 0000013 | | |
| No. | | | |
| ~~~~ | | | |

| | THE NO. | |
|------------------------------------|---|--|
| Borrower/Client FRANCISCO MAIOLINO | | |
| ST EO CODINTU OT | | |
| City PROVIDENCE | County PROVIDENCE State RI Zip Code 02907 | |
| Lender | WASHINGTON MUTUAL/CHASE | |

